NOTES

INTRODUCTION


2. An exception is Phoebe B. Stanton's "Pugin: Principles of Design versus Revivalism." Professor Stanton's thesis is that the main purpose of the Gothic Revival was "the discovery of a definition of art and the establishment of rules, principally of design, which could be used to reform England's impoverished taste in architecture and the arts of decoration" (p. 20). In other words, she believes that the Revival's motive was more aesthetic than religious, and she offers as support the buildings themselves, while speculating that contemporary architectural theory would confirm her findings. The evidence presented in the following pages seems to do just that.

CHAPTER ONE


6. Ibid., p. 15.

7. Ibid., p. xii. Cf. F. W. Cornish's comment: "And if our age, from its circumstances or its nature, wants material for art, if all our work must be more or less a Renaissance, not the new birth of a new creature, we must be content if our chief work should be to store up material for a future age... A generation may yet arise in whom a knowledge of past beauty may be the begetter of a new beauty, a living growth, not an imitation" ("Greek Beauty and Modern Art," pp. 335–36).


11. John Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, in *The Works of John Ruskin*, 8:248–49. Cf. Alfred Austin's remark: "The decay of authority is one of the most marked features of our time. Religion, politics, art, manners, speech, even morality, considered in its widest sense, have all felt the waning of traditional authority, and the substitution for it of individual opinion and taste, and of the wavering and contradictory utterances of publications ostensibly occupied with criticism and supposed to be pronouncing serious judgments. By authority I do not mean the delivery of dogmatic decisions, analogous to those issued by a legal tribunal from which there is no appeal, that have to
be accepted and obeyed, but the existence of a body of opinion of long standing, arrived at after due investigation and experience during many generations, and reposing on fixed principles or fundamentals of thought. This it is that is being dethroned in our day, and is being supplanted by a babel of clashing, irreconcilable utterances, often proceeding from the same quarters, even the same mouths" (The Bridling of Pegasus: Prose Papers on Poetry, p. 1).


18. Cram, Ministry, p. 22.


20. For discussions of this subject, see Morse Peckham, "Afterword: Reflections on Historical Modes in the Nineteenth Century"; and Jerome Hamilton Buckley, The Triumph of Time: A Study of the Victorian Concepts of Time, History, Progress, and Decadence, chap. 6.

21. The change from this condescending attitude is described as follows by a Victorian writer: "Whereas in these our actual times there is an ever wakeful sympathy with the past of history and society, a feeling sometimes reverential, sometimes regretful, sometimes compassionate, always keen and sensitive, an interest not only in the great actions, but in the every-day lives... in the standard writings of the eighteenth century, on the other hand, this interest is entirely mute, as though a whole department of intellectual curiosity had been as yet unopened. The style in which the writers of the 'Augustan age' of our literature looked back on the England of the past was that of immeasurable and self-satisfied superiority. Nothing, it seemed to them, was to be learned from those epochs of twilight civilization; then why waste time in deciphering their paltry riddles? These were the authorities who voted Shakespeare an inspired barbarian, and would only endure his genius in the travesties of Dryden" ([Louisa A. Merivale,] "On the 'Gothic' Renaissance in English Literature," p. 467).


23. For discussions of this subject, see John Gaunt, Victorian Olympus; Richard Jenkyns, The Victorians and Ancient Greece; and Frank M. Turner, The Greek Heritage in Victorian Britain.


25. W. Jackson Bate, The Burden of the Past and the English Poet, p. 22. Cf. Peacock's statement in "The Four Ages of Poetry": "Then comes the age of brass, which, by rejecting the polish and the learning of the age of silver, and taking a retrograde stride to the barbarisms and crude traditions of the age of iron, professes to return to nature and revive the age of gold." Compare, also, a comment by Letitia E. Landon: "We ourselves are standing on the threshold of a new era, and we are already hastening to make as wide a space, mark as vast a difference as possible, between our own age and its predecessor. Whatever follies we may go back upon, whatever opinions we may re-adopt, they are never those which have gone immediately before us. Already there is a
wide gulf between the last century and the present” (“On the Ancient and Modern Influence of Poetry,” p. 466).


29. *Builder* 8 (1850): 122. J. P. Seddon makes the same point: “It was, then, the unfortunate discovery, galvanizing, and deification, of the exhumed bones of the Classic, or, to speak strictly, Roman art, which was the veritable Gorgon’s head that paralyzed true and healthy art. Its influence was doubly fatal; first, by substituting precedent for thought; and secondly, by substituting second-hand Paganism for Christianity” (“The Dark Ages of Architecture,” pp. 269-70). Like Pugin, Seddon turns the tables by calling the Renaissance the Dark Ages. It should be pointed out, however, that a number of members present at the reading regarded Seddon’s views as extreme.


32. T. G. Jackson, *Modern Gothic Architecture*, p. 20. This is further proof of Phoebe Stanton’s thesis in “Pugin: Principles of Design” that the Revival was aesthetically motivated by a wish to restore art broadly, not Gothic specifically, or at least Gothic only insofar as it was a means to a larger end. I disagree with her thesis only in refusing to exclude the moral and religious motives, which I believe to be inextricable from the aesthetic in all art before Art-for-Art’s-Sake made the separation.


34. Ibid., p. 62. Here is an earlier version of the same figure of speech: “Reculer pour mieux sauter: the proverb implies that the forward spring must be preceded by a backward motion. There is no way of recovering first principles when obscured or lost but by the intelligent study of the past. It is just because men had become disgusted with traditions that had lost all their vitality, and conventionalisms that were fairly worn out, that they began to retrace their steps in search of truth, reality, and nature” ([Benjamin Webb,] “The Prospects of Art in England,” p. 147).

35. This comment by John Gloag is fairly typical: “The architecture produced by the Gothic revivalists was intrinsically reactionary; those who created it looked back, never forward, so in an age of fantastic material progress, architecture was out of step with science, engineering, commercial enterprise and industrial expansion” (*Victorian Taste: Some Social Aspects of Architecture and Industrial Design, from 1820-1900*, p. xv).


40. A. E. Street, p. 123.


42. Alfred Barry, *The Life and Works of Sir Charles Barry*, p. 79.

43. *Builder* 3 (1845): 299. A dedication to historical accuracy in adopting Gothic architecture often entailed an intolerance of other styles. The architect J. Henry Stevens reacted with impatience to such prejudice in his reply to an article by George
Gilbert Scott: "It is evident that all who cannot at once turn up preterpluperfect Goths, and sign the pledge, must be accessories before or after the fact, to the debasing of the current architecture of her Majesty's realm" (Builder 15 [1857]: 638). T. G. Jackson discovered the same sort of prejudice when he first began his career: "In 1858, then, nothing would pass muster with the young enthusiasts among whom I found myself in Scott's office but severe Geometrical Decorated, or, better still, the severer Transitional... The five orders of classic architecture were scoffed at... Anything modern, if not condemned outright, was regarded with suspicion" (Thomas Graham Jackson, Recollections of Thomas Graham Jackson, p. 56).

45. Roy Strong, Recreating the Past: British History and the Victorian Painter, pp. 47, 64.
46. Burges, p. 13n.
47. A. E. Street, pp. 121-22, 188.
49. W. J. Lawrence, for example, made this argument against absolute realism in historical drama: "Managers are apt to forget that playgoers are not all as pedantically censorious as the author of The Plant-Lore of Shakespeare, who wrote to Mr. Irving after seeing the early Lyceum revival of Much Ado about Nothing, pointing out that Leonato's garden presented an anachronism in the shape of a cedar, that species of tree being unknown in Messina at the period of the play" ("Realism on the Stage: How Far Permissible?", p. 286).
50. Jackson, Modern Gothic, p. 29.
51. A. W. N. Pugin, Contrasts, p. 43.
54. Pugin, Contrasts, p. 57.
55. Pugin, Apology, p. 22.
57. Owen Jones, The Grammar of Ornament, p. 8
58. Barry, p. 78.
60. Quoted in W. R. Lethaby, Philip Webb and His Work, p. 76.
61. Pugin, Apology, p. 38. The Ecclesiologist has also been frequently charged with narrow-mindedness in its advocacy of faithful reproduction of the old forms, but consider the liberality of this reply to Alexander Thomson's "A Protest against Gothic": "When Mr. Thompson [sic] speaks of Gothic as an imperfect art, we consider that he is really speaking in its favour. If it was so far perfected as to be incapable of further improvement and development we should rank it with the Athenian. We fully believe that it never did reach the perfection of which it is capable, and for this reason we hope that it may be left to us and our successors to carry it on, and, by making it our own, and honestly adapting it to all the multitudinous wants and comforts of such an age as this, to enlarge its already vast scope" ("Architectural Fitness and Originality," p. 239).
62. Ruskin, Seven Lamps, in Works, 8:196.
63. Scott, Remarks, p. vi. At the risk of belaboring the point, I again repeat that none of the important figures of the Revival recommend any other method. But I think it necessary to repeat the point because so many charges of rigid copyism have been brought against the Revival. One explanation for this contradiction is that practice did not always follow theory, as we see in an article in the Builder that approves Scott's
notions about the adaptability of Gothic and then asks, "Are these the principles on which the revival has been conducted? And the answer must be in the negative. Precendent, and precedent alone, has governed: the most slavish adherence to prescribed forms has been insisted on, and any architect who ventured on a departure from these, who dared to try the effect of a new combination, or sought to display a spark of invention, was hounded down in the most virulent and contemptuous manner" ("Present Condition of Architecture," p. 1). On the other hand, this remark obviously suggests, too, that some opposed the principle of freedom in theory as well as practice; but the leaders were not in this group and, indeed, regarded such opposition as a positive hindrance. Consider, for example, this comment by G. E. Street: "I know but one reason for the long predominance of this Classic style, and that is, that men in attempting to imitate Gothic art have copied, and no more; have not adapted it, and used it according to the necessities of the times; and so have raised an unnecessary and baseless prejudice against it, which it is difficult to overcome" ("A Plea for the Revival of True Principles of Architecture in the Public Buildings of Oxford," p. 403).

64. Ruskin, Works, 10:314.
70. Ibid., pp. 340-41
71. Quoted in Collins, p. 119.
72. Mark Girouard, Sweetness and Light: The "Queen Anne" Movement, 1860-1900.
73. Jackson, Recollections, p. 56.
74. A. E. Street, p. 86. See Roger A. Kindler's "Periodical Criticism, 1815-40: Originality in Architecture" for a recent discussion of this subject.
75. Ruskin, Works, 11: 70.
76. A. E. Street, p. 83.
77. G. G. Scott, Remarks, p. 271. Cf. Walter Crane's use of the organic simile to express the same idea: "Whereas art in past ages seems to have germinated and to have been continually evolved in new forms,—to be alive, and spontaneous, as it were, growing like a thing of nature, and expanding with man's ideas of nature, beauty, and life,—in our day this sense of spontaneity, this natural growth, is scarcely felt. Conscious and laborious effort takes the place of spontaneous invention, and originality is crushed by the weight of authority and precedent. The student is confounded and abashed by the mass of examples,—the dry bones in the strata of museums and books of what were once living and breathing organisms in the world of beauty. No form of architecture or art seems to spring naturally and unaffectedly out of the actual necessities and demands of daily life" ("The Architecture of Art," p. 313). See chap. 4 below for a discussion of the organic analogy used in this way.
78. G. G. Scott, Remarks, p. 18.
79. Burges, p. 8. Frederick J. Crowest made the fanciful wish for music: "Cannot we call upon the gods to favour us with, say, an earthquake, that shall rid us of everything that serves as style, model, foundation, or what not, in our musical creations? ... [The English composer] is quite unable to throw off the taint and to free himself from trammels which effectually preclude him from striking out a path for himself..." ("Wanted—An English Musical Style," p. 209).
NOTES TO PAGES 64–83


84. Reade, p. 537; Guillaume G. Huskisson, "The Architecture and Art of the Present," p. 369. The opening statement of purpose in the *Architect and Building Operative* focuses on the disparity between the stagnation of art, especially architecture, and the remarkable progress in all other areas of life ("Address to our Readers," p. 5).

85. Fergusson, *Historical Inquiry*, p. 71. Although he accepted evolutionary change in art, Fergusson was not prepared in 1849 to affirm "the strange hypothesis that one species could be developed out of another" (p. 68).

86. Ibid., p. 70.

87. Huggins, p. 186.


CHAPTER TWO


2. In this respect my approach to nineteenth-century architecture is like Hugh Honour's to eighteenth-century art: "When we try to understand the art of the late eighteenth century it does not matter very much which aspects seem most appealing now or which seem true or false by present-day standards. What matters is whether our conception of the whole, and hence the definition of our term, corresponds to what the artists thought and believed themselves" (*Neo-classicism*, p. 15).


5. Jones, p. 5.


7. A. E. Street, pp. 328, 316.

8. Ibid., p. 92.


10. A. E. Street, p. 124.

11. Ibid., p. 318.


14. Sir John Soane observed that the idea derives from classical times: "The ancient writers ... recommended the study of music to form part of an architect's education,
conceiving, perhaps, that a relish for the harmonies of tone would induce, by a sort of sympathy, a corresponding taste for those of proportion" ("Lecture on Architecture at the Royal Academy, 1832," p. 452).


16. A. E. Street, p. 345. William Burges similarly identifies rhythm with proportion in his comments on the recently completed Houses of Parliament: "There is one great thing to praise in that not very satisfactory building, the New Houses of Parliament, and that is its rhythm. Each part balances the other, and you can see at once that the man who designed it was, at all events, master of the great principles of his art" (Burges, p. 113).


18. Typical of this attitude is the following comment made in the Ecclesiologist: "But, like many other signs of hope in the present day, we are disposed to trace the progress [of the Gothic Revival] which has of late been made in a considerable degree to the writings of Sir Walter Scott: and whatever be his place among the chiefs of English Literature, he will we believe earn from posterity a higher praise than is ever the lot of any mere literary man, from the purity of his writings, and the lessons which his readers could not fail to draw from the truthful and attractive pictures he has given of those times which the grossness of a later age had treated with unmixed contempt" ("The French Académie and Gothic Architecture," p. 83).


21. The correspondence between philosophy and art, the theories of the latter reflecting those of the former, is made clear when the same metaphor describes both. Goethe somewhere says that nature is "the garment of life which the Deity wears," and Carlyle says that nature is "the Living Garment of God." A late nineteenth-century writer describes the artistic union of physical and spiritual with the same metaphor: "Art is the protean vesture that clothes in divers fashions the eternal, unchanging spirit of poetry whose unveiled purity is the poet's secret vision" (Martin Morris, "The Philosophy of Poetry," p. 509).

22. Cf. Ruskin's remark that "no man can be an architect, who is not a metaphysician" (The Poetry of Architecture, in Works, 1:5).

23. Frances Power Cobbe explains the two definitions of poetry in this way: "Poetry stands in a double position towards all forms of Art. It is an art—and, for many reasons, to be ranked the first of arts; but it is also the pervading spirit of all the other arts, in which the element of poetry has the largest and most important share. Poetry, expressed through the medium of language (to which we rightly give the name par eminence, because by language can it be most widely and perfectly expressed), is only one form of poetry. There is a poetry expressed in architecture, a poetry expressed in sculpture, in painting, and in music; and all these deserve to be estimated according to their value as poetry. Deduct the element of poetry from any art, and a mere Caput mortuum—a body without a soul—will remain" ("The Hierarchy of Art," pp. 98–99). A broad definition of poetry similar to this one had, of course, been in use for some time, although it had never been so widely employed.


25. Ibid., 10:269.

26. Ibid., 10:112.
CHAPTER THREE

1. The importance of the inner, spiritual quality is evident in such a comment as this: “Landscape painting's great object as an art ought to be the faithful rendering of the spirit and character of natural scenery and interesting localities. . . . Everything in landscape art ought to contribute to render with the most striking fidelity, not merely the scene, but that which is far deeper and more divine, the *spirit* of the scene” (Philip Gilbert Hamerton, “The Place of Landscape Painting amongst the Fine Arts,” p. 211).


3. Ibid., p. 189. This is what Ruskin calls the contemplative imagination. Tilley, seeing no difference between Ruskin's categories of contemplative and associative, combines them into what he calls the constructive imagination.

4. Gotthold Ephraim Lessing, *Laocoön: An Essay on the Limits of Painting and Poetry*, p. 106. A few years later Dr. Johnson was to make a similar distinction in evaluating the merits of Homer and Virgil: “We must consider (said he) whether Homer was not the greatest poet, though Virgil may have produced the finest poem. Virgil was indebted to Homer for the whole invention of the structure of an epick poem, and for many of his beauties” (*Life*, 22 September 1777).

5. Ruskin, *Works*, 11:201. In “The Art of Fiction” (1888), Henry James writes that “the deepest quality of a work of art will always be the quality of the mind of the producer”; and for John Sedding “the singular attractiveness of a work of art—poem, building, painting—is borrowed from the personality of its creator” (Sedding, p. 161).


7. The idea has continued in our own century, and in *Space, Time and Architecture*, Siegfried Giedion presents this version of it: “However much a period may try to disguise itself, its real nature will still show through its architecture, whether this uses original forms of expression or attempts to copy bygone epochs. We recognize the character of the age as easily as we identify a friend's handwriting beneath attempted disguises” (p. 19). As recently as 1978 Roger Dixon and Stefan Muthesius wrote in the first sentence of the “Introduction” to *Victorian Architecture*, “Victorian architecture is the reflection of unprecedented social, intellectual and technological change” (p. 8).


11. E. D. H. Johnson has dealt with the literary aspect of the artist's separation from society in *The Alien Vision of Victorian Poetry: Sources of the Poetic Imagination in Tennyson, Browning, and Arnold*.

12. A. E. Street, p. 319. Cf. Viollet-le-Duc's comment that in the Middle Ages artists were “les enfants du peuple” (quoted in Nikolaus Pevsner, *Ruskin and Viollet-le-Duc: Englishness and Frenchness in the Appreciation of Gothic Architecture*, p. 18); and Ralph Adams Cram's remark that English parish churches “are all a kind of material expression of society itself, not the self-conscious product of very specialized artists, but a precipitation in visible form of the character of the people that raised them in every hamlet of every county in England” (*The Significance of Gothic Art*, p. 6). David Watkin has recently attacked this idea, which he calls “an art-historical belief in the all-dominating *Zeitgeist*” and which he blames for a failure to appreciate “the imaginative genius of the individual” (*Morality and Architecture: The Development of a Theme in Architectural History and Theory from the Gothic Revival to the Modern Movement*, p. 115).

13. Here is a late Victorian statement of the idea: Evolution has shown that “there is no order of phenomena which is not conditioned by its environment, which does not depend on circumstances outside itself; and of this great rule poetry is a signal ex-
ample. The greatness or the littleness of the poetry of any given period depends to some extent on the faculties of the poets themselves; but to some extent also, and far more than was once thought, it depends on the social conditions into which the poets have been born . . ." (W. H. Mallock, "The Conditions of Great Poetry," p. 156). See also John Addington Symonds, "On the Application of Evolutionary Principles to Art and Literature," in Essays: Speculative and Suggestive, pp. 27–52. Herbert Spencer and Hippolyte Taine are yet better known exponents of the idea.


15. Pugin, Apology, p. 4. The survival of this attitude in modern times is apparent from John Gloag's recent comment that "buildings cannot lie; they tell the truth directly or by implication about those who made and used them and provide veracious records of the character and quality of past and present civilizations" (The Architectural Interpretation of History, p. 1).


18. Pugin, Apology, p. 4; Jackson, Recollections, p. 121.

19. Cram, Ministry, p. 27.

20. Lethaby, Philip Webb, p. 64.

21. Jackson, Recollections, p. 121

22. Pugin, Apology, p. 5.


25. Fergusson, Historical Inquiry, pp. 165–66. Cf. George Henry Lewes's belief that "unless a writer has Sincerity, urging him to place before us what he sees and believes as he sees and believes it, the defective earnestness of his presentation will cause an imperfect sympathy in us. He must believe what he says, or we shall not believe it. Insincerity is always a weakness; sincerity even in error is strength ("The Principles of Success in Literature," p. 95).


27. Durandus, pp. xxii, xxvi.

28. A. E. Street, p. 58.


30. Quoted in Georg Germann, Gothic Revival in Europe and Britain: Sources, Influences, and Ideas, p. 9.

31. A. E. Street, pp. 334, 34.

32. Ruskin, The Queen of the Air, in Works, 19:389. Similarly a reviewer commends A. F. Rio for showing in The Poetry of Christian Art that "to execute a great and good work, a man must first make himself great and good; that genius itself must take its inspiration from a still higher source; and that the man who would decorate the Temple, must in the same Temple sanctify his thoughts and ways" ("The Poetry of Christian Art," p. 353).


34. Clark, p. 149.

35. Van Brunt, p. 379.


37. Samuel Huggins explains the causal relationship between function and expression in this way: "Exact adaptation of form to purpose is the most direct element of expression, and assists more largely than is generally supposed in characterising the
structure. It is an essential,—nay, the foundation of all artistic expression. Utility or necessity called for the building, and the building, if the architect has faithfully responded to that call, will, in the absence of artistic expression, generally hint at the purpose. In most cases where fitness is thus attended to, the expression is in a great measure given,—the character of the edifice is half formed" ("Expression in Architecture," p. 325).

38. Pugin, Contrasts, p. 1. A. E. Street tells us that his father designed the plan of the Law Courts before the elevation in order "to make his exterior not merely contain the interior, but explain it and express its uses" (A. E. Street, pp. 166–67).

39. A. Welby Pugin, The True Principles of Pointed or Christian Architecture, p. 27.


41. Vitruvius, The Ten Books on Architecture, pp. 14–15. In the eighteenth century the suitability of style to subject was usually known as decorum. A poet used an elevated style for an epic, a familiar style for a verse epistle; a painter similarly employed one style for a historical picture and another for a portrait. The genre dictated the treatment in poetry and painting just as the type of building determined the style appropriate to it.

42. Architecture, Essai sur l'art, rpt. and trans. in Helen Rosenau, Boullée and Visionary Architecture, pp. 98, 100.


44. Thompson, p. 118.


47. Basing his remarks upon a belief that "it is not the form of a work of art that gives it value, but the thought that is bestowed upon it," James Fergusson asserted that many Dutch pictures "attempted, and with wonderful success, to reproduce nature by patient, painstaking fidelity, but with about the same quantity of mind as is required by a camera obscura to produce a daguerrotype. On the other hand, we possess certain sketches by Raphael and Michael Angelo, made with a pen or piece of chalk, without, if I may use the expression, any labour at all; but these few hurried, careless scratches do express an idea sometimes of the highest quality, and which now reproduce an emotion of beauty which all the art of a Mieris or a Metzu never could pretend to" (Historical Inquiry, p. 149).

48. Ibid., p. 152. C. F. A. Voysey also subordinated the mechanics of building to what he calls "ideas in things": "All art is the expression or manifestation of thought and feeling; therefore a technical knowledge of any craft by itself is but a language with which to express thought and feeling" ("Ideas in Things," in Davison, p. 105).


51. Fergusson, Modern Styles, p. 103.

52. Cram, Ministry, p. 144.


54. Ecclesiological Society, p. 185.

55. Kerr, Gentleman's House, pp. 368–69; Voysey, p. 104; Collins, p. 109; Summer- son, Heavenly Mansions, pp. 172–73; Clark, p. 191.

56. Lessing, p. 17.
CHAPTER FOUR

1. This account is from the Ecclesiologist 21 (1860):250.

4. In the eighteenth century Warburton had mentioned the concept in a note on Pope's Moral Essays, and in our own century Spengler repeated it in The Decline of the West. Sir James Hall provided a variation on the idea by proposing that Gothic originated as an imitation of wicker work (Essay on the Origin, History, and Principles of Gothic Architecture), and Sir Walter Scott cited Hall as his source for the following description in The Lay of the Last Minstrel:

   The moon on the east oriel shone
   Through slender shafts of shapely stone,
   By foliaged tracery combined;
   Thou would'st have thought some fairy's hand
   'Twixt poplars straight the ozier wand,
   In many a freakish knot, had twined;
   Then framed a spell, when the work was done,
   And changed the willow-wreaths to stone.

7. A. E. Street, pp. 89, 182.
8. Garbett, p. 68.
9. Huggins, p. 3.
10. Baillie Scott, p. 149. Cf. Frank Lloyd Wright's comment, "Let our Universities realize and teach that the law of organic change is the only thing that mankind can know as beneficent or as actual" (An Organic Architecture, p. 45).
12. A. E. Street, p. 86.
13. Cram, Ministry, p. 29.
14. A good illustration of organic form used to support subjective expressionism in architecture is this comment: "As the convolutions of a shell, the spiny processes that guard its mouth, or the rich and delicate colours that bespeak its character as the home of life, convey to the naturalist positive information as to the nature of the animal which, in the dim laboratory of the sea, surrounded its soft flesh with a cuirass of porcelain; so do structural fabrics [buildings] reveal very much of the nature of the race that reared them" ([Francis R. Couder,] "Modern Architecture and Its Assailants," p. 386).
15. Samuel Huggins uses the analogy to organic form in arguing for objective expressionism in architecture: "True works of architecture speak to us just as nature does. In nature form exists by and through the essence—the spirit creates the form, and the idea of its time must create the building—its qualities must be represented on the same principles as in the works of creation" ("Expression in Architecture," p. 326).
16. A. E. Street, p. 342
17. Baillie Scott, p. 146. Thirteen years earlier (1896) Louis H. Sullivan had written, "It is the pervading law of all things organic, and inorganic, of all things physical and
metaphysical, of all things human and superhuman, of all true manifestations of the head, of the heart, of the soul, that the life is recognizable in its expression, that form ever follows function. This is the law" (Kindergarten Chats and Other Writings, p. 208).

19. A. E. Street, p. 79.
26. A. E. Street, p. 17; Stevenson, An Inland Voyage (1903).
27. Opposed to the eighteenth-century concept of uniform nature and belief in the beauty of general nature is the nineteenth-century idea that "of all the principles of beauty by which nature appears to move, one of the most striking seems to be variety. . . . Every natural appearance is varied, and to a much greater extent than cursory observers would imagine" (John Zephaniah Bell, "The Taste of the Day," p. 293). Carol T. Christ has discussed the artistic implications of this change in The Finer Optic: The Aesthetic of Particularity in Victorian Poetry.
30. Jones, p. 5. The novel, according to Henry James, is organically unified as well: "A novel is a living thing, all one and continuous, like any other organism, and in proportion as it lives will it be found, I think, that in each of the parts there is something of each of the other parts" (The Art of Fiction).
31. William Gilpin, Observations, Relative Chiefly to Picturesque Beauty, Made in the Year 1772, on Several Parts of England; Particularly the Mountains, and Lakes of Cumberland and Westmoreland, 1:xiv.
32. Ibid., 2:188.
33. Dream houses, such as the one to which the poet and Emily will elope in Shelley's Epipsychidion, could be as organically conceived as Gilpin's ruins or Wordsworth's cottages:

It scarce seems now a wreck of human art,
But, as it were, Titanic; in the heart
Of Earth having assumed its form, then grown
Out of the mountains, from the living stone,
Lifting itself in caverns light and high:
For all the antique and learned imagery
Has been erased, and in the place of it
The ivy and the wild vine interknit
The volumes of their many-twining stems.

A modern version of this idea is Eero Saarinen's comment, "The conviction that a building cannot be placed on a site, but that a building grows from its site, is another principle in which I believe" (Eero Saarinen on His Work, p. 6).
NOTES TO PAGES 167–74

34. Pevsner, *Pioneers of Modern Design from William Morris to Walter Gropius*, p. 132. Cf. Wright’s ideas about building the new house: “My sense of wall was not a side of a box. It was enclosure to afford protection against storm or heat when this was needed. But it was also increasingly to bring the outside world into the house, and let the inside of the house go outside. In this sense I was working toward the elimination of the wall as a wall to reach the function of a screen, as a means of opening up space...” (*An Autobiography*, p. 139). Wright, however, was not prepared for Philip Johnson’s Glass House; upon entering it Wright expressed his uncertainty as to whether he should remove his hat, not knowing if he was inside or out. Ellen E. Frank has discussed the relationship between buildings and nature in “The Domestication of Nature: Five Houses in the Lake District,” pp. 68–92. As my remarks should make clear, what she calls the domestication of nature I prefer to think of as the naturalization of architecture.

CHAPTER FIVE


3. Price, p. 82.

4. A. E. Street, p. 331.

5. Barry, p. 21. Corresponding to the rising popularity of the picturesque and the change in taste from regularity to irregularity is the liking for odd numbers over even numbers. Boileau at the age of forty-six had in a poem reckoned his age at forty to satisfy the requirement of art to admit no odd numbers over nine. Presumably Wordsworth is within the bounds of this rule in “We Are Seven” but careless of it when he sets Matthew’s age at seventy-two and Simon Lee’s at thirty-five. Indeed, even before Wordsworth, Hogarth had written that “it is a constant rule in composition in painting to avoid regularity” and that “odd numbers have the advantage over the even ones, as variety is more pleasing than uniformity...” (*The Analysis of Beauty*, chaps. 3, 4). It was, however, Jane Austen who associated odd numbers directly with the picturesque. When, in *Pride and Prejudice*, Darcy invites Elizabeth to join himself and two others in a walk, Elizabeth banters, “No, no; stay where you are. The picturesque would be spoilt by admitting a fourth.”

6. A. E. Street, p. 331.

7. Price, p. 83. Sir James Hall, Price’s contemporary, makes the same point: “The Grecian style excels in all those qualities of *elegance* and *grace*, which depend upon the nice adjustment and masterly execution of details. Whereas the Gothic style, which, with great truth, has been compared to the genius of Shakespeare, is lively, picturesque, and sublime, qualities which are derived from the bold variety, and often from the wild irregularity of its forms” (p. 147).


10. Lethaby, *Philip Webb*, p. 121. On the assimilation of the picturesque into the beautiful, see Robert Kerr’s remark: “I have always considered Burke to be egregiously in error when he draws a distinction between beauty and the sublime, and Price or Gilpin, or whoever it is, when he draws a distinction between beauty and the picturesque. Such distinctions are philosophically false. You may distinguish between the
picturesque beautiful and the non-picturesque beautiful; but the picturesque itself is only one province of the beautiful" ("Remarks on Professor Donaldson's 'Architectural Maxims and Theorems,'" p. 267). There is an interesting parallel between the breakdown of distinctions separating the beautiful, the sublime, and the picturesque; the breakdown of distinctions separating genres within art forms; and the breakdown of distinctions separating art forms themselves that was the subject of chapter 2. One is tempted as well to view the gradual acceptance of Gothic from a sociological perspective and to consider Gothic as rising from lowly status to middle-class respectability despite opposition by the classical aristocracy.

15. Hitchcock, 1:25.
17. Quoted in Barry, p. 60.
18. G. G. Scott, Remarks, p. 258. There seems to be complete agreement on this matter. Samuel Huggins rejected the picturesque for its own sake ("Expression," p. 325), and J. L. Petit, arguing that the builders of the original Gothic never consciously attempted it, criticizes modern architects because "now we aim at picturesque; we discover in it a great source of beauty, and therefore endeavour to obtain it by every means in our power.... But an artificial picturesqueness, as we have observed, is all but valueless..." ("Utilitarianism in Architecture," p. 58).

19. Petit, p. 37. Petit was somewhat extreme for his time, though less so for later in the century, in citing furnaces and fortifications as examples of picturesque beauty gained by a utilitarian approach to building. More moderate and typical is Samuel Huggins's statement five years earlier (1851) that "truthfulness of treatment in design will assist us to originate it [the picturesque]; nay, will itself suggest or produce it" ("Expression," p. 325).

21. Cf. Archibald Alison's comment that "our admiration attaches itself only to those greater productions of the art, in which one pure and unmingled character is preserved, and in which no feature is admitted, which may prevent it from falling upon the heart with one full and harmonious effect" (Essays on the Nature and Principles of Taste, 1:130. The first edition was published in 1790. In America, Edgar Allan Poe was the most famous proponent of unity of feeling.

23 Trotman, p. 107.
27. Quoted in Thompson, p. 305.
28. Voysey, p. 121.
33. Ibid., p. 74.
34. Alison, 1:4-6. George L. Hersey's *High Victorian Gothic: A Study in Associationism* is the most thorough discussion of the influence of associationism on architecture.
35. Thomson, “Enquiry into the Appropriateness of the Gothic Style for the Proposed Buildings for the University of Glasgow,” quoted in Pevsner, *Some Architectural Writers*, p. 184. For those, like Thomson, who were unable to give up the traditional concept of beauty as harmony of form, a new category, similar in purpose to those of the picturesque and unity of feeling, was established to accommodate pleasures derived from the association of ideas, and this was generally labeled “poetic.” (See above, chap. 2.) W. H. Scott, for example, makes this distinction between the beautiful and the poetical: “We shall venture to include all that is properly called beautiful under the definition of harmony, and to refer the beautiful, improperly so called, or what we now name the poetical, to the head of association. We are not saying, it will be observed, that the Beautiful and Poetical never meet and intermingle in the same subject; nothing, on the contrary, is more common: but we say that the two are always distinguishable in idea, and may be separate in fact. Harmony, then, is the philosophy of the Beautiful, and association its poetry” (“The Theory of the Picturesque,” p. 4).
36. Here is a late Victorian version of the idea: “Not only is imagination necessary for the production of a work of art, but it is also necessary for the understanding of it. The conception which is born of imagination can only be apprehended by imagination. Hegel indeed makes a distinction between the active or productive imagination of the artist, and the passive or receptive imagination of the beholder of a work of art, and calls them by different names; but in reality the difference between them is one of degree and not one of kind. The impression which is made upon the beholder of a work of art, though doubtless far less intense, is no doubt similar in kind to that which the artist himself had when he conceived it” (Arthur Tilley, “The Poetic Imagination,” p. 185).
38. Alison, 1:11-12.
41. J. E., “Grecian and Gothic Architecture,” p. 511. Clough was to maintain, on the contrary, that centuries of classical education had provided sufficient familiarity for an appreciation of Greek architecture:

\[
\text{Tis not, these centuries four, for nought} \\
\text{Our European world of thought} \\
\text{Hath made familiar to its home} \\
\text{The classic mind of Greece and Rome.}
\]

*Dipsychus*, 4

Wordsworth implies in “The world is too much with us,” however, that belief, not just knowledge, is the prerequisite. Those who argued for modern subjects in painting and poetry did so largely because such subjects were more familiar, and therefore more evocative, than historical subjects.
42. Price, p. 482.
43. Jones, p. 5.
45. Christopher Ricks, Tennyson, p. 49.
46. [Coventry Patmore,] "Architects and Architecture," p. 656.
47. Baillie Scott, p. 144.
50. Fergusson, History of the Modern Styles, 2:164. The poet to whom Fergusson refers is Milton:

But let my due feet never fail
To walk the studious Cloysters pale,
And love the high embowed Roof,
With antick Pillars massy proof,
And storied Windows richly dight,
Casting a dimm religious light.

Il Penseroso

But compare Clough's lines:

Maturer optics don't delight
In childish dim religious light,
In evanescent vague effects
That shirk, not face, one's intellects.

Dipsychus, 4

See also his "Epi-strauss-ium" for a similar idea. As for external lighting, Ruskin was not the first to recommend viewing buildings in darkness when he said Westminster Abbey should be seen at five in the morning. Walter Scott had earlier advised the observer of Melrose Abbey to

Go visit it by the pale moonlight;
For the gay beams of lightsome day
Gild, but to flout, the ruins grey.

The Lay of the Last Minstrel, 1. 2

52. Garbett, p. 75.
53. Ibid., p. 229.
55. An early discussion of polychromy in Greek art is Kugler's Ueber die Polychromie der Griechischen Architektur, und Sculptur und ihre Grenzen (Berlin, 1835).
57. Voysey, p. 114.
58. Jackson, Modern Gothic, pp. 81–82. Ingress E. Bell also commented on "that tendency observable in contemporary architecture to bestow too much care on the accessories, and too little on the general design, inducing a quality which I cannot better describe in a single word than by the title I have chosen for this paper [unrest]" ("'Unrest' in Architecture," p. 536).
CHAPTER SIX

3. Wornum, p. 11***.
4. Cram, *Ministry*, p. 127. Cf. Vernon Lee's comment that "art is at the same time two very different things: it is the product of a given mental condition, and it is the producer of another mental condition..." ("Comparative Aesthetics," p. 300).
5. Eastlake, p. 265.
8. A. E. Street, p. 62.
10. A. E. Street, p. 74.
19. Ibid., p. 113.
22. Pugin, *Contrasts*, p. 3. In 1860 a Dr. Barlow read a paper before the R.I.B.A. in which he commented that "the very designs of sacred edifices—their forms, arrangements, and ornamentation,—all have their origin in a significant symbolism, and were conceived and carried out in accordance with it" ("Symbolism in Reference to Art," p. 97).
24. Jackson, *Modern Gothic*, pp. 95–98. So did G. G. Scott; see his comment made during the discussion following Dr. Barlow's "Symbolism in Reference to Art" (note 22, above).
25. Robert Kerr, *The Newleaf Discourses on the Fine Art Architecture*, p. 145. Some, however, argued that one need not be consciously aware of symbolism for it to have effect. A Mr. White, Fellow of the R.I.B.A., responded to Dr. Barlow's "Symbolism in Reference to Art" by saying that symbolism's "presence and influence was felt, even although those who felt it had no knowledge of that which was represented. Thus... porch, font, nave, choir, chancel, sanctuary, altar, etc., simply and solely symbolical as they were, had an effect on those entering the building, though their attention had never been called to the symbolism itself" (*Papers Read at the R.I.B.A.* 4 [1857–60]: 109).

CHAPTER SEVEN

6. Joseph Gwilt, *An Encyclopaedia of Architecture: Historical, Theoretical, and Practical*, p. 792. First published in 1842. This anecdote has elsewhere been attributed to Chesterfield although I have not been able to find it. It recalls Francis Bacon's remark, "Houses are built to live in, and not to look on . . ." ("Of Building").
7. A. E. Street, p. 59. Sham fronts were treated humorously in M'Cann's "Song on Pugin's *Contrasts*":

Some raise a front up to the street,

Like ould Westminster Abbey;

And then they think the Lord to cheat,

And build the back part shabby.

For stuccoed bricks, and such like tricks,

At present all the rage is,

They took no one in! those fine ould min!

In the "pious Middle Ages!!!"

Quoted in Ferrey, p. 116

Consider also Longfellow's lines:

In the elder days of Art,

Builders wrought with greatest care

Each minute and unseen part;

For the Gods see everywhere.

"The Builders"

10. Ferrey, p. 120.
13. A. E. Street, p. 77.
17. Quoted in Thompson, p. 128.
18. Dresser, p. 68.
20. Gwilt, p. 792. Pugin seems to have been right about the exterior wall serving no structural function and acting only as a screen to conceal the flying buttresses, but both he and Gwilt were wrong about the dome. Harold Dorn and Robert Mark have recently shown that there is a third, conical dome between the outer and inner ones, and that the combination of the three domes makes for a much stronger structure than the
single dome of St. Peter's, which has cracked and had to be wrapped with ten iron chains ("The Architecture of Christopher Wren").

28. Ibid., p. 34.
37. Rpt. in Kindergarten Chats and Other Writings, p. 187.
40. Jones, p. 5.
42. Germann, p. 125.
43. Pugin, Contrasts, p. 1; True Principles, p. 12. Cf. James Gowans's statement, "If a thing has the look of fitness and true structural proportion, it will please the eye without further adornment" ("The Useful, Structural, and Beautiful, in Architecture," p. 945).
45. Dresser, p. 19.
48. Pugin, Present State, p. 31; Baillie Scott, pp. 150–51.
49. Lethaby, Philip Webb, p. 125.
52. A. E. Street, p. 113.

CONCLUSION

1. A. Welby Pugin, Some Remarks on the Articles Which Have Recently Appeared in the "Rambler," Relative to Ecclesiastical Architecture and Decoration, p. 11.
2. Shaw, letter to Mrs. Foster, 18 October 1892, quoted in Saint, p. 290.